2004

Censured Mystics: Expression and Accusation in Sixteenth Century Spain

Allison Ralph
University of North Florida

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.unf.edu/ojii_volumes
Part of the History Commons

Suggested Citation
http://digitalcommons.unf.edu/ojii_volumes/85
Censured Mystics: Expression and Accusation in Sixteenth Century Spain

Allison Ralph

Faculty Sponsor: Dr. Michael Francis, Associate Professor of History

In sixteenth-century Spain, women were among the individuals in society with the most limits placed on their behavior, and with the least ability to practice self-determination. Since social and religious norms are interrelated and influence each other, their twin ladders of social mobility are also related. Some courageous women created for themselves upward social mobility by using the separate hierarchy of religious devotion. Since ecstatic religious experience and special access to the holy were regarded as a gift from God, this religious hierarchy could be described as level of access to the holy and was less defined and more fluid than traditional class hierarchies. Female mystics could provide a better life for themselves through their piety, and could also give help in the form of special access to the holy to their communities. Any woman wishing to use the ladder of religious devotions to move up or out of her own social status could do so as long as she stayed close enough to defined orthodox positions. If the woman did not adhere closely enough to either religious orthodoxy or social conformity, then she was likely to face condemnation by the Inquisition.

Peter Brown describes the connection to the holy as a sort of chain of intermediaries, the last link of which is the self.¹ This chain, or network, might include saints, or items associated with them and persons through which closer access to the saints or Christ might be found, mystics. One scholar explained the significance of living saints by saying, “and yet, there are saints on earth because the Almighty can still . . . communicate and give himself. He can descend and dwell in the person of a saint . . . Each saint is . . . a king of Revelation of God, he has a message to deliver, . . . he is an instrument of the Divine, he is the Man (and Woman) in whom God, who is love, finds not only His resting place but also His acting place.”² In his text, The Cult of the Saints, Brown argues that the relationship formed between Christians in the late Roman era and their cult of the saints was like an improved version of the traditional patron/client relationship of Roman society.³ Early saints were martyrs whose miraculous deaths gave them a special connection to God, and that this connection was transferable. Brown demonstrates how this holy presence could be transferred to relics, such as pieces of the saint’s body, or even items that had come into contact with the body, and then to people who used the relics to effect cures or other miracles. Even though later saints were not necessarily martyrs, they retained in the eyes of their devotees the same status as benevolent patrons. By the sixteenth century, even persons who had not yet been confirmed

¹Peter Brown, 66.


³Brown, 41. Brown argues that the saint represented the truly good version of the patron, who was truly benevolent and who could be worshiped without constraint.
saints, but whose piety and demonstrable connection to the sacred made them likely candidates to become saints, were sought after by their communities as providers of this special connection. Mystics, as persons who could distribute the sacred, had become the representative of the patron saint to the client, thus putting them in a position of religious power and authority. Persons in this position of authority were effectively in competition with the Church for religiously devoted clientele. For this reason, the Spanish church tried its best to keep those who claimed this authority in line with Church doctrine, and within reach of its judicial capabilities.

The Spanish Inquisition had good reasons to look out for both its masters. It was at its core an organization formed to help police the Catholic faith of those in Spain who it felt were out of line and possibly dangerous to the continued orthodoxy of others. One inquisitor tried to explain why it was necessary to control the worst abuses of doctrine, “You know how a sheep sick with some contagious disease, does harm to the entire flock where she is, but by killing her the rest of the herd is saved. For this reason, God ordered that the grape vine that does not give fruit and is infected, or is capable of infecting others, should be cut off and thrown into the fire.”

In the period before the ratification of the decrees of the Council of Trent and the clarification of doctrine that the ratification would entail, part of the function of the Inquisition was to shape and define religious orthodoxy. In 1523, just a few years into the massive upset of the Catholic Church by the separation of Luther, Francisca la Brava discovered that the definition of appropriate religious experience had changed. Just ten years before, a shepherd blessed with a vision of the Virgin had been rewarded with a position as alms-collector in the new shrine that was built as a result of the vision. Francisca claimed to have received a series of visions in which the Virgin came to her and gave her devotional instructions, verbal proofs of her divinity, and several small objects. Despite priestly warnings to keep quiet about the vision because of worries over the increased activity of the Inquisition, Francisca was unable to contain herself, and told neighbors and friends of her divine gift. The young mother was eventually questioned and then sentenced to a public whipping. The wording chosen by the Inquisition to describe her offenses is telling. “It is evident from everything that Francisca is much at fault for having seriously offended against our holy Catholic faith by publicly affirming that Our Lady appeared to her twice, . . . when it is all trickery and falsehood . . . By rights we could have treated her more rigorously, for the above matter was very public and scandalous for the Christian faithful, since she attracted them and induced them to believe in what she said and made known, when it was all vanity and frivolity.”

In the period before the ratification of the decrees of the Council of Trent and the clarification of doctrine that the ratification would entail, part of the function of the Inquisition was to shape and define religious orthodoxy. In 1523, just a few years into the massive upset of the Catholic Church by the separation of Luther, Francisca la Brava

---

4Mad for God 48.

5Apparitions, 150.

6Apparitions, 179.
how a woman chose to move through or out of her social station and whether or not she did so successfully.

Intense personal experiences such as the viewing of apparitions and visions could lead to a community’s involvement in building a new shrine, or renewing a forgotten devotion and in so doing bring them closer to their faith. One of the last seers to do this work successfully did so in 1490. Joana, a servant girl, claimed to her master that the Virgin Mary had appeared to her, requesting that a chapel be built. A few days later, Mary appeared to the girl a second time and provided her with a miracle with which to prove to the disbelieving townsfolk that her story was true. The people of the town, now believing, went in procession to the appointed place, and there built a chapel as instructed which still stands in honor of the Virgin.7 Once an individual like Joana had been gifted with the presence of holiness, they could become involved in refereeing the continued devotion the Saint had requested thus putting them in a position of power, and receive the praise of the community itself. Joana was made a hermitess of the new chapel, “and everyone touched her clothes out of devotion, and cut pieces from it to take as relics, because they held her to be a saint.”8 Joana, by sharing her ecstatic vision, brought her community closer to its faith, and herself newfound respect and fame. Although Joana provided a general service to her community by giving them another place of worship, other mystics brought their gifts to individuals.

Maria de la Santissima Trinidad was known for her cures that she performed by channeling the healing power of saints to persons in need through devotional items. Maria Rodero was healed in this way by the sister. The patient’s skin sores were cured by a touch from a tunic from a local shrine to the Virgin Mary administered by Sister Maria. Maria Rodero believed she had been cured not by the nun herself, but by the intervention of the Virgin Mary after the nun’s specific request.9

Female mystics, who would never have been able to perform the tasks of hearing confession and giving absolution or communion, could perform a function much like that of an oracle by allowing glimpses into the sanctity of God. They often made predictions and gave out blessed rosary beads or crosses and in this way allowed seeking individuals to take home a piece of the holy as a relic. Maria de Agreda was well known for this practice. She gave out blessed rosary beads to the hundreds that made their way to her convent, and encouraged people to use the items when invoking or pleading with God.10 By this kind of donation to the relic-seekers, Maria and others like her could show their possession of the holy by regulating access to these little pieces of sanctity through their graciousness in giving.11 Sister Maria increased not only her own fame by this practice, but that of her convent as well. Juana de la Cruz was another woman who managed by her reputation as holy woman, to bring financial

7Apparitions 103 -108.

8Apparitions, 108. Joana’s later life is much more sketchy, she may have left her post as hermitess in favor of the more mundane life of marriage.

9Haliczer 255.

10Haliczer 225.

11Peter Brown 89. Brown expresses this idea more broadly than is used here, but the concept is the same.
stability and notoriety to her convent. As a young nun, she received an extraordinary vision in which Christ himself ordered her to remain mute. Only after several attention-getting, but silent, months, she received the order to speak again, but with the voice of the Savior himself. For thirteen years, she spoke with the voice of the Holy Spirit during public trances. Although this talent brought her praise, it also brought opposition from her superiors who believed her to be acting. After several attempts to silence the girl, Juana’s superiors were finally persuaded of her sanctity after a trance occurred during which impressions were made on her skin in place of stigmata. She claimed to have been carried to the Crucified Christ by an angel and to have had the marks pressed into her skin by the Christ. After this, the unfettered Juana increasingly found herself in a position of authority. She was permitted to preach to and pray for anyone who came to hear her, and was eventually elected prioress of her convent for an unprecedented term of seventeen years. During this time, through her fame and influence, she increased the holdings of her convent from a few sparse acres with an insignificant endowment to an influential and important institution of the Church. Both Maria de Agreda and Juana de la Cruz used their position as intermediary between the sacred and profane and the increased social status that came with that position as tools in the struggle for influence both for themselves and their orders.

Of all the women mystics in Spain during this period, perhaps the best known is Teresa de Avila. This extraordinary woman was able to challenge the methods of her own Carmelite Order and found a reformed version, the Discalced Carmelites. In one of the most amazing reversals of gender roles achieved by any of our women, she was able to secure permission to found male monasteries on the same reformed lines.

Teresa de Avila was able to use her faith as a source of strength and calm in her life. Her first triumph through this means was her successful disobedience to her father. She snuck away from home and joined the Carmelite convent in her hometown of Avila directly against her father’s wishes. The reason for her continued success throughout her life, against great odds, was not only her constant reliance on her faith, but that her piety was so visible to others around her. Even though her visions and trances were so important to her personally, the mere fact of their existence was not what allowed her to found fourteen monasteries over the course of her life. It was that she shared what was believed to be her great and intense connection to God with others. She visited people, spoke with them, advised them, and prayed for individuals of all sorts. It was the public nature of her piety that enabled her to do so much. Her accomplishments, achieved as they were through her faith and the public nature of her mysticism, are still attributable mostly to her own personal will. She was an incredibly innovative and intelligent woman who was able to use her piety like stepping stones to get where she wanted to go. She used to her faith to overstep the bounds that would have constrained her otherwise.

There was no such thing as freedom of speech in sixteenth-century Spain and

grievances with the king or his policies were strictly out of bounds. As the Spanish public was not devoid of persons with worries over exactly that, an acceptable method of public expression was in need. Prophecy, since it carried the authority of God, was one possible way of expressing those concerns. Lucrecia de Leon, ever the opportunist, seized her chance. Over the course of her prophetic career, she and her confessor publicized her dreams concerning the destruction of the kingdoms of Spain. However, Lucrecia was not the first mystic to provide this service. A millennial group had begun after a seer, Piedrola, or the “Soldier Prophet” began publicizing his predictions of the empire’s downfall. When he was arrested, Lucrecia appeared almost immediately publicizing similar predictions, ready and willing to inherit Piedrola’s position. One of the key turning points in Lucrecia’s story was the defeat of the Spanish Armada in 1588, which she had been predicting since December 1587, such that the king himself had heard of her. With Lucrecia’s prediction right on the mark and further negative projections, her publicizing suddenly seemed very dangerous to the Crown. As Kagan has noted, although the Inquisition did not merely serve the Crown, political business was sometimes expedited through those courts. Philip II had finally taken issue with her explicit criticisms of himself and his policies, and moved personally to have her arrested by the Inquisition. This was Lucrecia’s first arrest. She was forced to admit that she had made up her dreams and that they were false, but within a year, she was out publishing millennial predictions again. She was arrested a second time in 1592, for the same offenses. This time she was subjected to a trial which lasted over five years at the end of which she made a full confession. She was banned from her home, and after a relatively light punishment, disappeared from the historical record, never to be heard from again. Lucrecia’s successes demonstrate the fluid and less gender-bound nature of the religious hierarchy. She as a young woman of only average future, took over a public position in society previously occupied by a male and was equally accepted by the community. Without her use of religious experience she would have remained unknown and relatively uninteresting.

Individuals could sometimes receive something from Saints that they were otherwise lacking. Catarina Tomas, a young girl who had been orphaned and sent to live with an extremely harsh aunt and uncle, often received help and comfort from her visions of saints. Once, having been ordered to gather herbs on a dangerously high cliff, Catarina was helped by a vision of St. Catherine of Alexandria, who took her hand
and led her down. The saint then admonished her not to come up so high again, “even if they order you to do so.”

In this case, not only did the girl receive help in the form of a motherly figure, which she surely had need of, she also received permission to disobey further orders by the unassailable authority of a Saint. As this story demonstrates, individuals, through the use of religious devotion and ecstatic experience, such as the receipt of a vision, could escape the confines and restraints of every day life. Jacinta de Atondo was able to use her ecstatic visions and trances as a form of escapism from the horrible abuse she received at home. In an effort to break her will and force her to submit to their choices for her, her family, and especially her aunt, engaged a woman to beat the girl on a weekly pattern, each day having its own gruesome regimen. She was also locked in a single room during daylight hours and forced to complete the family housework overnight. Even her confessor, who was responsible for her spiritual health, sided with the family and ordered that she scourge herself and fast daily. Although she conformed to the desires of her family and followed their wishes, she also became extremely devout and withdrew into herself and the visions that she received. Once she gained entry into a convent, she quickly became known for her piety and extraordinary extended trances. After her death at age 71, she had become so well known that the Franciscan order began immediately to collect evidence to be placed in her canonization dossier. Jacinta, having been placed in an extremely harsh situation, found relief from her daily toils in her ecstatic experience. That she continued her trances and visions after she had escaped the abusive situation gives insight into the amount of pleasure and comfort she found in the realm of the holy.

Mysticism as a vocation, for those who chose it or those whose experiences led them to it, often gave an increase in social status for the mystics themselves or their families. This increase in social status could be dangerous for the mystic, particularly if the mystic was poor, and even more so if she appeared to relish her newfound status. The required maintenance of the appearance of poverty, or at least disdain for wealth, highlights one of the fundamental questions surrounding these women. Because of the financial and social benefits to be gained by their activities, it is hard to know who among them were heartfelt in their piety and placed their religion before their successes, and who viewed their religious activities as a means to an end. This idea was expressed by a woman around 1700, “everyone naturally desires wealth and esteem. Men have many ways of achieving them, whether by arms, learning, or sainthood, . . . but women who are poor and of common birth, when they see that everyone praises them and gives them everything they need when they are considered virtuous and holy, are easily fooled in this way by the devil.”

Some women who appeared to be honest in their claim to sanctity were later discovered to have been dishonest, and certainly there were women who meant well, but whose lack of education in the proper doctrines of the Church made them targets for the

---

18Haliczer 157.
19Haliczer, 162 - 164.
20Apparitions, 197. Quoting Antonio Arbiol, Desenganos mysticos a las almas detenidas, o enganadas en el camino de la perfeccion Impresion Nona Barcelon, Thomas Piferrer, 1772. 78
Inquisition. In the case of Catalina Ballester, it is clear that her spiritual career began as a means of support for her family after the death of her husband. She was able to support her family quite well on donations she received from wealthy admirers, and was even granted free living space for her family from a pair of pious sisters of minor nobility. Through the means of her public religiosity, Catalina was able to provide financial stability, not to mention increased social status by her close affiliation with persons of a higher social class. If she had been able to content herself with these considerable achievements she might never have been called before the Inquisition. However, she found that the combination of her unaccustomed wealth and lack of living expenses gave her more cash than she knew what to do with. She was denounced to the local tribunal after she returned to her home village, which she had left as shirtmaker, in finery and dress that, “was that of a great lady.”

Had she chosen to claim her new class standing only through association to the highborn, she probably would have retained her increased standing without trouble. It was only when she moved to assume that standing herself that she became the subject of suspicion. On top of these inherent dangers, women in Spain during this time period had the distinct disadvantage of being considered morally, spiritually, and physically inferior to men by the Holy Office. To overcome this disadvantage, female mystics would need a great deal of support. It was essential for women mystics to have the backing of their confessor, the local townspeople, and if applicable, the male leaders of their religious order. In a society that counseled an extremely high level of control over women, few females were ever in a position of control over themselves, but one of the few choices that a woman might be allowed to make for herself was the choice to enter religious or cloistered life, which was one of the only socially acceptable options other than marriage. Convent life could also provide intangible benefits like steady access to a single confessor. Women outside of convent life, especially poor women, often had trouble being taken seriously by their local priests. Juana Bauptista testified before the Inquisition that five of her seven confessors had dismissed out of hand her claim to have had visions. One even told her he was, “glad she had told him so that ‘people could throw stones at her and call her crazy.’”

For mystics who could not gain access to convent life for one reason or another, they could still become well known for their religiosity. Some women were able to gain influence or achieve their goals even though they did not have the direct support of a convent; Luisa de Carvajal is one such. First, she chose of her own volition not only to take the four vows of poverty, chastity, obedience, and the pursuit of spiritual perfection, but to do so without joining a convent; Luisa de Carvajal is one such. Finally, she took a vow to pursue martyrdom. She decided that to fulfill this last extraordinary vow, she would travel to

21_Haliczer, 107.
22_Haliczer, 48.
23_This is Haliczer’s main argument, that women required the support of a well-defined network that included the male leaders of her religious order, her confessor, and well-connected supporters in the lay population.
24_Haliczer, 110.
Anglican England as a missionary for the Catholic Church. From this point, she managed to convince “her superiors, her king, and even the pope to support her mission.”25 That she in fact did go to England, was arrested several times, and spent years engaged in highly visible and illegal political and religious activities is a testament to her own will. It was her voluntary act of self-subjugation to the will of God, in the form of her desire for martyrdom, that allowed her to transcend the limits that would otherwise be placed on her as a woman. By her spiritual subjugation, she was able to prove to her superiors that she was all the things a pious woman should be; obedient, controlled and politically inactive, while actually overcoming all of these obligations. She was neither obedient nor controlled, as she had no one to answer to, and she was definitely politically and publicly active. Furthermore, her triumphs give clear proof to the fact that through their use of religious devotion, women could and did find self-determination, power, influence, and the means to their own ends. Not all women were as lucky as Luisa though, most women who were without religious vocation tread on somewhat thinner ice than their cloistered counterparts.26 Because they lacked the close support group they were more likely to have if they had taken official vows, they were more often forced to resort to miracles and prophecies to prove their sanctity. They were also in greater danger because they did not necessarily have access to approved role models and knowledgeable teachers of doctrine. Maria Cotonilla, a peasant whose

complete illiteracy left her with only hearsay about previous saints as role models, was unable to construct a theology that was compatible with the Church. She discovered this when her method of proof turned out to be too far outside of orthodoxy. She had built her local reputation for mysticism on her ability to report to the townspeople on the fate of their deceased loved ones. Her increasingly wild stories about her spiritual visits to heaven, hell and purgatory made her clients more concerned than credulous. She once told the mother of boy who had killed himself that his soul was in purgatory, a statement that was far away from the Church’s doctrine that suicides were irrevocably condemned to hell.27 She was called before the Inquisition after concerned neighbors denounced her as a possible heretic to the local tribunal. Upon being asked who it was that had taught her to pretend to have visions and trances, Maria replied that no one had. She had apparently gleaned her knowledge of the lives of previous saints, which she then used to fashion her own persona, from local villagers.28 In effect, it was her illiteracy, and lack of access to approved role models that proved to be her downfall. As Maria’s story demonstrates, if one too many of a mystic’s healings failed, or if in her search for proofs she made statements that were less than orthodox, a well-thought-of mystic could suddenly find herself called before the Inquisition.

In his study of female mystics, Stephen Haliczer found that the most commonly successful were those who had come from well-connected families and who

25Luisa de Carvajal’s 896.
26Haliczer, 97.
27Haliczer, 113.
28Haliczer, 41.
already had some standing in the community. If a woman came from a respectable family, and she was well-thought of among the leaders of her own order, then she was much less likely to face denunciation to the Inquisition, and any opposition she did face would be less credible. However, a strong support group was not necessarily foolproof against suspicion, as was the case with Sor Maria de la Visitacion. Maria, a prioress of her aristocratic convent at only 33, had gained renown for her piety and excellent religious record, and particularly for one of the greatest divine favors, stigmata. She had an excellent network of support, which included King Phillip II’s nephew as well as Pope Gregory XIII, and had already become the subject of a praise-filled spiritual biography by a well-respected religious man. All of her hard work came to nothing, however, when she played her cards too openly and began publicly supporting the exiled leader of Portugal after Philip II’s seizure of that country. Philip, furious with her interference in politics, ordered an investigation into her sanctity, particularly into her stigmata. After much protestation, Sor Maria was finally forced into washing her hands in front of the Inquisitors, who watched triumphantly as her painted stigmata were carried down the drain by the soapy water. Although her sanctity was eventually disproved, Sor Maria, through her reputation for sanctity, had gained fame and influence far beyond what her family name could provide, and what her gender would have limited her to.

Maria’s fall from grace was the immediate consequence of her movement outside the bounds allowed by he combined social and religious hierarchies. She had become spiritually successful, and was well within the bounds of orthodoxy since she was not spreading heresies, but as she stretched her influence into international politics, which was outside her reach as a woman and because she made her endorsement directly opposite the King, she lost her footing on social orthodoxy. Maria’s story shows us exactly how far women could go by using religious devotion as the ladder to success, but also the dangers that accompanied that success. Maria and other women like her were innovative and courageous women who used the limited means available to them to make their lives better, but it was a dangerous road, and one not all of them tread successfully.

References


Haliczer, Stephen. Between Exaltation and Infamy: Female Mystics in the...


